

**INTERNATIONAL DOLPHIN CONSERVATION PROGRAM
INTERNATIONAL REVIEW PANEL**

PERMANENT WORKING GROUP ON TUNA TRACKING

MINUTES OF THE 12TH MEETING

**La Jolla, California (USA)
5 February 2003**

Chair: Ms. Pat Donley (United States)

AGENDA

1. Opening of the meeting
2. Adoption of the agenda
3. National Tuna Tracking Plans
4. Review of the implementation of the dolphin safe certification system
5. Technical modifications to the dolphin safe certificate
6. Guidelines and procedures for using the dolphin safe label
7. Recommendations for the IRP
8. Other business
9. Date and place of next meeting
10. Adjournment

APPENDICES

1. List of attendees
2. TTFs received by the Secretariat, 24 Sep-31 Dec 2002

DOCUMENTS

- TT-12-03 Review of national tuna tracking and verification plans
TT-12-04 Amendment of tuna tracking system and certification procedures
TT-12-04a Summary of dolphin-safe certification program (revised)
TT-12-05 Technical modifications to the AIDCP *dolphin safe tuna* certificate

The 12th Meeting of the Permanent Working Group on Tuna Tracking was held in the Jolla, California (USA), on 5 February 2003. The attendees are listed in Appendix 1.

1. Opening of the meeting

The meeting was opened by Ms. Pat Donley, of the United States, the Chair of the Working Group.

2. Adoption of the agenda

The provisional agenda was adopted as presented.

3. National Tuna Tracking Plans

In accordance with the instructions of the 31st meeting of the International Review Panel, the Secretariat presented Document TT-12-03 on the review of national tuna tracking and verification plans. Dr. Robin Allen, Director of the Inter-American Tropical Tuna Commission (IATTC), explained the criteria that were taken into account for the review.

The majority of the plans were found to be generally consistent with the requirements of the AIDCP Tuna Tracking and Verification System (System), but only those of El Salvador and Vanuatu were found to be fully consistent.

The countries that have plans are Costa Rica, Ecuador, El Salvador, Guatemala, Mexico, Panama, Peru, United States, Vanuatu and Spain. In the case of Colombia and Venezuela, the working group considered that the documentation presented was incomplete and did not constitute a valid tuna tracking plan.

Bolivia, the European Union, Honduras and Nicaragua do not yet have plans.

It was agreed that the Secretariat would write to the six countries that do not have national tuna tracking and verification plans to inform them that they should not issue any dolphin safe certificates until they have a plan that the IRP has confirmed as consistent with the System.

Mr. Asdrúbal Vásquez presented a detailed report on the Tuna Tracking Program of Costa Rica, and printed copies of his presentation were distributed. El Salvador volunteered to present its tuna tracking program at the next meeting of the Working Group.

4. Review of the implementation of the dolphin safe certification system

The Secretariat presented a report (Appendix 2) showing the number of original TTFs and copies of TTFs received by the Secretariat for the period 24 September through 31 December 2002. It was noted that several TTFs were received shortly before the meeting and could not be included in the report. The report showed that 156 original TTFs were received from 234 trips. If copies of TTFs received by the Secretariat were included, the total number of TTFs increased to 203 from 234 trips. Although the report shows that several countries are doing very well, it was also noted that two countries had not returned any TTFs from a total of 29 trips.

The Secretariat was asked about the five cases in which the responsible Party was listed as “unknown”. Dr. Allen explained that in cases in which the observer leaves the vessel before it reaches its port of unloading (for example, when a vessel stops in Panama), if the TTFs are not sent to the Secretariat, then the Secretariat does not know where the tuna was unloaded. It was suggested that the observer stay aboard the vessel until it reached its port of unloading. Although it was noted that this idea had been explored in the past, the Secretariat agreed to prepare a report for the working group on the cost of keeping observers aboard vessels.

Colombia also requested that the Secretariat investigate the procedures used by its office in Panama for sending TTFs to the Secretariat in order to find out if some were being lost or whether they were being held longer than they should be.

Dr. Allen presented Document TT-12-04, suggesting amendments to the tuna tracking system and certification procedures to ensure that tuna caught by a vessel without a DML, or whose captain is not on the AIDCP List of Qualified Captains, would not be considered to be dolphin safe. The Working Group agreed to the two amendments as presented by the Secretariat and agreed that they should be circulated to the Parties through correspondence for their formal approval.

5. Technical modifications to the dolphin safe certificate and

6. Guidelines and procedures for using the dolphin safe label

Technical modifications to the *AIDCP Dolphin Safe* certificate (Document TT-12-05) and associated changes in the *Procedures for the Certification of AIDCP Dolphin Safe Tuna* were thoroughly discussed, but further analysis and changes to the Certificate will be needed before it can be forwarded to the IRP.

The Working Group, noting that some of the changes in the Certificate and the procedures possibly could not be implemented without changes to the resolution adopted by the Meeting of the Parties, decided to ask the Secretariat to do the following: (1) review how the certification program is working, with supplementary information provided in letters from Costa Rica, and develop modifications to the certificate for the consideration of the working group; (2) provide the resulting report and certificate to the members of the working group for review before the next meeting. Also, modifications to the *Procedures for Dolphin Safe Tuna Certification*, first presented by the Secretariat at the 11th meeting of the Working Group, need to be finalized. The members of the Working Group were asked to provide suggestions for modifying the new certificate and any comments on the modified procedures to the Secretariat as soon as possible.

Dr. Allen presented a summary of the Dolphin-Safe Certification Program (Document TT-12-04a), which explained the guidelines used by the Secretariat for handling queries about the accuracy of the information on dolphin-safe certificates. This document tabulated the cases in which the total weight of yellowfin tuna reported on a certificate exceeded the estimated total weight recorded on the corresponding TTF by the observer. Of the 33 dolphin safe certificates from all trips which departed on or after May 1, 2002, and available to the Secretariat as of February 5, 2003, 17 showed an amount of yellowfin greater than that reported on the TTF. However, in only two cases was this difference in weight greater than 10%. The Secretariat was asked to suggest, as part of its analysis, what percentage of difference between the weights shown on certificates and on TTFs should be used to indicate a need for further investigation.

7. Recommendations for the IRP and the Meeting of the Parties

The Working Group agreed to recommend that the the *Tuna Tracking and Verification System* and the *Procedures for the Certification of AIDCP Dolphin Safe Tuna* be amended in accordance with the proposals in Document TT-12-04.

8. Other business

No other business was discussed.

9. Date and place of next meeting

It was agreed that the next meeting of the Working Group would be held immediately prior to the next meeting of the IRP, scheduled to take place in Guatemala in June 2003.

10. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned on 5 February 2003.

Appendix 1.

**INTERNATIONAL DOLPHIN CONSERVATION PROGRAM
PROGRAMA INTERNACIONAL PARA LA CONSERVACIÓN DE LOS DELFINES**

**PERMANENT WORKING GROUP ON TUNA TRACKING
GRUPO DE TRABAJO PERMANENTE SOBRE EL SEGUIMIENTO DEL ATUN**

12th MEETING – 12^a REUNION

**February 5, 2003
La Jolla, California**

ATTENDEES - ASISTENTES

BOLIVIA

**GONZALO SANCHEZ
ALFREDO ROJAS**
Ministerio de Defensa Nacional

COLOMBIA

JAIME JIMENEZ
Ministerio de Agricultura y Desarrollo Rural

**ALVARO BUSTAMANTE
DIEGO CANELOS
ARMANDO HERNÁNDEZ**

COSTA RICA

**ASDRÚBAL VÁSQUEZ
GEORGE HEIGOLD**
INCOPECA

EL SALVADOR

RENE SALGADO
CENDEPESCA

EUROPEAN UNION – UNION EUROPEA

ROBERTO CESARI
European Commission
JAVIER ARÍZ TELLERÍA
Instituto Español de Oceanografía

**CARLOS DOMINGUEZ
IGNACIO ESCOBAR
JUAN I. ARRIBAS**
Secretaria General de Pesca

MEXICO

**GUILLERMO COMPEAN
PEDRO ULLOA
LUIS FLEISCHER**
Instituto Nacional de la Pesca
**RICARDO BELMONTES
VIRGILIO JUAREZ
MARIO AGUILAR**
CONAPESCA

**MICHEL DREYFUS
HUMBERTO ROBLES**
PNAAPD
**MAXIMO CARVAJAL
LUIS FUEYO MACDONALD**
SEMARNAT/PROFEPA
ERNESTO ESCOBAR

PANAMA

ARNULFO FRANCO
Autoridad Marítima

PERU

JORGE VERTIZ
Ministerio de la Producción

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA - ESTADOS UNIDOS DE AMERICA

DAVID HOGAN
Department of State
SUSAN JACKSON
BARRY MILLS
MARCELA CAMPA
PAUL KRAMPE
JAMES LECKY
REBECCA LENT
PAT DONLEY

ALLISON ROUTH
NICOLE LEBOEUF
BRETT SCHNEIDER
CATHY CAMPBELL
JESSICA KONDEL
CHRISTOPHER FANNING
WILLIAM JACOBSON
MICHELLE ZETWO
National Marine Fisheries Service

VANUATU

HUGO ALSINA LAGOS
Office of Deputy Commissioner of Maritime Affairs

ORGANIZACIONES NO GUBERNAMENTALES--NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS

NINA YOUNG
The Ocean Conservancy

INDUSTRIA ATUNERA -TUNA INDUSTRY

GABRIEL SARRÓ
OPAGAC

SECRETARIA – SECRETARIAT

ROBIN ALLEN, Director
ERNESTO ALTAMIRANO
DAVID BRATTEN
ALEJANDRA FERREIRA
JOSHUE GROSS

MARTIN HALL
BRIAN HALLMAN
BERTA JUÁREZ
NICHOLAS WEBB

Appendix 2.

RSA originales y copias recibidas por la secretaría al 31/ene/2003*
Original and copies of TTFs received by the Secretariat to 31/Jan/2003*

Autoridad Nal. Responsable	Viajes	Orig. y copias rec.	Aut. Nal. Responsable	Viajes	Orig. y copias rec.
Responsible National Authority	Trips	Orig. And copies rec.	Responsible National Authority	Trips	Orig. And copies rec.
BOL	7	7	PAN	12	12
COL	9	9	PER	1	1
ECU	66	66	SLV	4	4
ESP	7	7	USA	10	10
GTM	5	5	VEN	47	24
HND	5	5	VUT	4	4
MEX	56	48	Total	234	203

** Viajes iniciados después del 24/Sep/2002 y que arribaron al 31/dic/2002*

** For trips starting after 24/Sep/2002 and arriving on or before 31/Dec/2002*



PROGRAMA INTERNACIONAL PARA LA CONSERVACION DE LOS DELFINES
INTERNATIONAL DOLPHIN CONSERVATION PROGRAM

**GRUPO DE TRABAJO PERMANENTE SOBRE EL SEGUIMIENTO DEL ATUN
PERMANENT WORKING GROUP ON TUNA TRACKING**

12ª REUNION -- 12TH MEETING

LA JOLLA, CALIFORNIA (USA)

5 FEB 2003

DOCUMENTO TT-12-03

**ANÁLISIS DE PLANES NACIONALES DE SEGUIMIENTO Y
VERIFICACIÓN DEL ATÚN**

Por instrucciones de la 31ª reunión del Panel Internacional de Revisión, la Secretaría ha examinado en detalle los planes nacionales de Seguimiento y Verificación del Atún presentados por los gobiernos de Colombia, Costa Rica, Ecuador, El Salvador, España, Estados Unidos, Guatemala, México, Panamá, Perú, Vanuatu y Venezuela. Bolivia, la Unión Europea, Honduras, y Nicaragua no presentaron planes.

La mayoría de los planes presentados son generalmente consistentes con las disposiciones del Sistema de Seguimiento y Verificación de Atún del APICD, pero solamente aquellos de El Salvador y Vanuatu son completamente consistentes.

La Secretaría considera que la documentación presentada por Colombia y Venezuela es incompleta y no constituye un plan válido de seguimiento de atún.

La Secretaría no analizó el plan presentado por España, ya que España no es parte del APICD y entendemos que la propuesta de la Unión Europea, misma que incluirá a España, será presentada próximamente.

La Secretaría ha informado a cada gobierno de sus conclusiones, y de las modificaciones que considera necesarias en cada caso para garantizar consistencia con el Sistema del APICD.

DOCUMENT TT-12-03

REVIEW OF NATIONAL TUNA TRACKING AND VERIFICATION PLANS

As instructed by the 31st meeting of the International Review Panel, the Secretariat has reviewed in detail the national Tuna Tracking and Verification plans submitted by the governments of Colombia, Costa Rica, Ecuador, El Salvador, Guatemala, Mexico, Panama, Peru, Spain, United States, Vanuatu and Venezuela. Bolivia, the European Union, Honduras, and Nicaragua have not submitted plans.

The majority of the plans presented are generally consistent with the requirements of the AIDCP Tuna Tracking and Verification System, but only those of El Salvador and Vanuatu are completely consistent.

In the view of the Secretariat, the documentation submitted by Colombia and Venezuela is incomplete and does not constitute a valid tuna tracking plan.

The Secretariat did not review the plan submitted by Spain, since Spain is not Party to the AIDCP and we understand that the proposal of the European Union, which will include Spain, will be submitted soon.

The Secretariat has informed each government of its conclusions, and of the modifications it considers necessary in each case to ensure consistency with the AIDCP System.

INTERNATIONAL DOLPHIN CONSERVATION PROGRAM
PROGRAMA INTERNACIONAL PARA LA CONSERVACION DE LOS DELFINES

PERMANENT WORKING GROUP ON TUNA TRACKING

12TH MEETING

LA JOLLA, CALIFORNIA (USA)
FEBRUARY 5, 2003

DOCUMENT TT-12-04

**AMENDMENT OF TUNA TRACKING SYSTEM AND CERTIFICATION
PROCEDURES**

It has come to the attention of the Secretariat that, under the current *System for Tracking and Verifying Tuna* (System) and *Procedures for AIDCP Dolphin Safe Tuna Certification* (Procedures), tuna caught by a vessel without a DML which sets on dolphins could be considered dolphin safe. This is not a hypothetical problem: in 2002 some of the tuna caught by a vessel fishing on dolphins without a DML was recorded as dolphin safe on the Tuna Tracking Form for that trip.

If the Parties agree that such tuna should not be considered dolphin safe, this problem could be remedied by adding a new paragraph to the end of Section 2, GENERAL, of the *System*, as follows:

"Notwithstanding the definition of dolphin-safe tuna established in this document, any tuna caught in sets in which dolphins were intentionally encircled by vessels without a DML or whose captain is not on the List of Qualified Captains maintained by the Secretariat, shall not be considered to be dolphin safe."

Further, the *Procedures* could be modified by amending paragraph 2.f. as follows:

"~~[For vessels with DMLs,]~~Only tuna caught by vessels with a DML and with a captain on the List of Qualified Captains maintained by the Secretariat shall be eligible to receive the *AIDCP Dolphin Safe Certificate*. This provision shall not apply to those vessels authorized to fish in the Agreement Area that do not have a DML and that do not fish for tunas associated with dolphins."

INTERNATIONAL DOLPHIN CONSERVATION PROGRAM
PROGRAMA INTERNACIONAL PARA LA CONSERVACION DE LOS DELFINES

PERMANENT WORKING GROUP ON TUNA TRACKING

12TH MEETING

LA JOLLA, CALIFORNIA (USA)
FEBRUARY 5, 2003

DOCUMENT TT-12-04a

SUMMARY OF DOLPHIN-SAFE CERTIFICATION PROGRAM (REVISED)

The *Resolution to establish procedures for AIDCP dolphin safe tuna certification* of June 2001 establishes the following criteria for issuing dolphin safe certificates:

1. The certificate is signed by a competent national authority whose signature is recognized by the Secretariat.
2. The certificate references a valid TTF for dolphin safe tuna.
3. Tuna caught by vessels with DMLs will only be eligible for dolphin safe certification if the fishing captain was on the List of Qualified Captains.

There are 465 TTFs listing wells containing dolphin safe tuna from all trips which departed on or after July 1, 2001, and finished before May 1, 2002, and 426 for the period of May 2, 2002, to February 1, 2003. To date, the Secretariat has received 114 dolphin safe certificates issued by national authorities. Of these, all met the three criteria except for four that did not meet criterion 3.

The Secretariat uses the following guidelines for queries about the authenticity of any dolphin safe certificate:

1. The Secretariat will only respond to questions about specific certificates from potential importing states or companies.
2. If the certificate meets the three requirements above the response will be that the certificate is valid.
3. If the Secretariat does not have the information it needs to verify 1 or 2 above, it will first ask the competent national authority to provide the information before replying.
4. Otherwise the Secretariat will reply that the certificate is not valid.
5. No other information will be provided about the contents of the TTF.

No inquiries have been received to date regarding the validity of a dolphin safe certificate.

Questions may arise about the validity of a certificate if the data on the certificate does not match the data on the corresponding TTFs. On 17 of the 33 dolphin safe certificates from all trips which departed on or after May 1, 2002, and available to the Secretariat as of February 5, 2003, the amount of yellowfin tuna on the certificate was greater than the amount of dolphin safe yellowfin recorded on the corresponding TTFs, in one case by 30%, as detailed in the table below. The Secretariat has received the original TTFs corresponding to 31 of these certificates, copies for 1, and none for one.

Trip	YFT (mt)		Difference	
	Certificate	TTFs	mt	%
129467	1053	809	244	30
130204	277	246	31	12
129811	544	506	38	7
128662	908	858	50	6
129875	783	742	41	6
129148	907	859	48	6
130270	242	231	11	5
129812	510	488	22	4
129470	338	327	11	4
129900	816	789	27	3
130218	835	808	27	3
130247	454	439	15	3
129993	838	814	24	3
129949	716	696	20	3
130150	1114	1083	31	3
130079	501	490	11	2
130078	836	825	11	1

INTERNATIONAL DOLPHIN CONSERVATION PROGRAM
PROGRAMA INTERNACIONAL PARA LA CONSERVACION DE LOS DELFINES

PERMANENT WORKING GROUP ON TUNA TRACKING

12TH MEETING

LA JOLLA, CALIFORNIA (USA)
FEBRUARY 5, 2003

DOCUMENT TT-12-05

**TECHNICAL MODIFICATIONS TO THE AIDCP *DOLPHIN SAFE TUNA*
CERTIFICATE**

At the 11th Meeting of the Permanent Working Group on Tuna Tracking, held in La Jolla in October 2002, the Panel discussed proposals for modifying the procedures for the certification of *AIDCP Dolphin Safe* tuna and some modifications of the *AIDCP Dolphin Safe* certificate. The version of the certificate attached to this document incorporates the modifications agreed at that meeting.

Also at that meeting, the delegation of Costa Rica proposed that the *AIDCP Dolphin Safe* certificate should allow, if necessary, information on catches recorded on more than one TTF to be recorded, to cover situations in which a processed lot included tuna from several trips. This proposal is incorporated in the attached draft certificate, which also includes more complete instructions.



CERTIFICATE NO. _____

AIDCP Dolphin Safe Tuna Certificate

This document certifies that the tuna or tuna products associated with it, and with the Tuna Tracking Forms (TTFs) indicated herein, were harvested by a vessel of a Party to the Agreement on the International Dolphin Conservation Program (AIDCP), meet the *dolphin safe* standards established pursuant to the AIDCP, and may bear the *AIDCP Dolphin Safe* Certification Mark. For verification of this certification, or for information on the AIDCP, please contact the AIDCP Secretariat, c/o Inter-American Tropical Tuna Commission, 8604 La Jolla Shores Drive, La Jolla CA 92037-1508, USA; Tel: 858 546 7100; Fax: 858 546 7133; www.iattc.org; or by e-mail to dsafemaster@iattc.org

See instructions on reverse

A.	Whole frozen weight of the tuna associated with this certificate:										
	TTF number				Yellowfin			Other species			
1.							MT			MT	
2.							MT			MT	
3.							MT			MT	
4.							MT			MT	
5.							MT			MT	
6.							MT			MT	
7.							MT			MT	
8.							MT			MT	
9.							MT			MT	
10.							MT			MT	
	Total:							MT			MT

B. Primary processing and total weight of the tuna associated with this certificate:			
	Primary processing type:		Weight:
Yellowfin:			MT
Other species:			MT

C. Certification by AIDCP Competent National Authority:	
The competent national authority authorizes the bearer of this Certificate to utilize the <i>AIDCP Dolphin Safe</i> Certification Mark on the packaging of any product containing tuna specifically associated with this Certificate.	
Signature:	SEAL or STAMP
Name:	
Agency:	
Date (day-month-year):	

INSTRUCTIONS FOR COMPLETING THE AIDCP *DOLPHIN SAFE* CERTIFICATE

Certificate No.: **Do not write in these spaces**

IMPORTANT: In Sections A and B, cross out with an “X” any boxes in which you do not enter information. Any certificate with blank boxes will be invalid.

A. TTF NUMBER and WHOLE FROZEN WEIGHT OF THE TUNA ASSOCIATED WITH THIS CERTIFICATE

On lines 1 to 10, for each *Tuna Tracking Form* (TTF) associated with this certificate, enter the number of the TTF, and the total confirmed scale weight (**before processing**), in metric tons, of the yellowfin tuna (*Thunnus albacares*, code YFT) and, if applicable, other species of tuna corresponding to that TTF. Other species are typically:

Common name	Scientific name	Code
Bigeye tuna	<i>Thunnus obesus</i>	BET
Skipjack tuna	<i>Katsuwonus pelamis</i>	SKJ
Pacific bluefin tuna	<i>Thunnus orientalis</i>	PBT

For these other species, record only the total tonnage; there is no need to record the species nor to break down the total by species. On the **Total** line, enter the sum of the tonnages of each of the two categories on lines 1-10.

B. PRIMARY PROCESSING AND TOTAL WEIGHT OF THE TUNA ASSOCIATED WITH THIS CERTIFICATE

If the fish associated with this certificate has been processed, enter for each category (**Yellowfin** and **Other Species**) the type of primary processing (loins, canned, etc.) and weight, in metric tons, of the finished product. If the certificate refers to whole frozen fish, enter “N/A” (not applicable) under **Primary processing type** and cross out the spaces under **Weight**.

C. CERTIFICATION BY AIDCP COMPETENT NATIONAL AUTHORITY

SIGNATURE, NAME, AGENCY, DATE AND OFFICIAL SEAL

The certificate is invalid without the official stamp of the competent national authority and the name and signature of a representative of that authority whose name and signature are registered with the Secretariat.