## INTERNATIONAL DOLPHIN CONSERVATION PROGRAM

# PERMANENT WORKING GROUP ON TUNA TRACKING

# 41<sup>st</sup> MEETING

San Diego, California (USA) 16 August 2018

# **DOCUMENT TT-41-01**

## MATTERS RELATED TO THE TUNA TRACKING AND DOLPHIN SAFE CERTIFICATION PROGRAMS

This report provides information regarding the submission of Tuna Tracking Forms (TTFs) to the Secretariat as well as comparisons of dolphin safe certificates and their corresponding TTFs for trips that ended from 1 September 2017 through 31 May 2018. It also includes an overview of the historical rates of compliance of TTF submissions to the Secretariat since 2008, and provides updates regarding the special cases monitored by the Working Group.

#### 1. SUMMARY OF THE DOLPHIN SAFE CERTIFICATION PROGRAM

The <u>Procedures for AIDCP dolphin safe tuna certification</u> establish the following criteria for issuing dolphin safe certificates:

- 1. The certificate is signed by a competent national authority whose signature is recognized by the Secretariat.
- 2. The certificate references a valid TTF (or TTFs) for dolphin safe tuna.
- 3. Tuna caught by vessels with DMLs is eligible for dolphin safe certification only if the fishing captain is on the List of Qualified Captains.
- 4. The competent national authority issuing the certificate has a tuna tracking system consistent with the AIDCP.

The Secretariat applies the following guidelines for queries about the authenticity of any dolphin safe certificate:

- 1. The Secretariat responds to questions about specific certificates from potential importing states or companies only.
- 2. If the certificate meets the four requirements above, the response is that the certificate is valid.
- 3. If the Secretariat does not have the information it needs to verify 1 or 2 above, it first asks the competent national authority to provide the information before replying.
- 4. Otherwise, the Secretariat replies that the certificate is not valid.

No other information is provided about the contents of the TTF.

#### 2. ORIGINAL TTFs RECEIVED BY THE SECRETARIAT

Table 1 reflects compliance by national authorities with the deadline for the submission of TTFs to the Secretariat, established in the <u>System for Tracking and Verifying Tuna</u> (STVT), as amended in June 2015, which states that "Within ten days of receipt of a TTF, the competent national authority shall transmit an electronic copy of the TTF to the Secretariat. The original TTFs received during a calendar month shall be transmitted to the Secretariat by the competent national authority at the latest 15 days after the end of that

month".

As indicated in the 'Trips' column in Table 1, at the time of drafting this report, the Secretariat has received 594 original TTFs from the 644 trips completed during the period of 1 September 2017 through 31 May 2018. For reference, Table 1 also shows the corresponding percentages presented at the Working Group's previous three meetings (38 through 40).

Table 2 shows the historical percentages of original TTFs received by the Secretariat since 2008, and reflects the total number of TTFs received. The percentage in this table does not reflect the timing required in the section of the STVT cited above, and only includes original TTFs received at any time.

## 3. COPIES OF DOLPHIN-SAFE CERTIFICATES RECEIVED BY THE SECRETARIAT

Between 1 September 2017 and 3 July 2018, the Secretariat received 450 copies of dolphin-safe certificates. All the certificates, corresponding to 115 TTFs completed during 115 fishing trips, were considered valid. A certificate was canceled by the competent national authority due to clerical errors, and a certificate was canceled by the Secretariat because it refers to an RSA that does not appear in its records. The Secretariat contacted the relevant national authority, which acknowledged its error, but did not issue a corrected certificate. Figure 1 shows the comparison of estimated weights, as recorded by observers on the TTF-A<sup>1</sup>, and the recorded scale weight for each TTF included in the 448 dolphin-safe certificates. The certified tonnage (16,104 t) represents 4.1% of the total of 392,145 t recorded as dolphin-safe on the TTFs of the 644 completed trips.

According to the <u>Procedures for AIDCP Dolphin Safe Tuna Certification</u>, the national authority is notified of cases where the scale weight recorded for each TTF included in the dolphin safe certificates exceeds the estimated weight recorded by the observer in the RSA by 10% or more. In none of the 115 trips, the certified weight exceeded the estimate in the corresponding RSA..

## 4. MONITORING OF SPECIAL CASES

During its 31<sup>st</sup> meeting in October 2012, the Working Group discussed three cases of apparent forgery of TTFs. One of these cases was presented at the 30<sup>th</sup> meeting in June 2012, and the other two at the 31<sup>st</sup> meeting in October 2012. During its 37<sup>th</sup> meeting in June 2016, the Working Group discussed a case in which catches shared between two vessels were not documented on the TTF.

The current situation regarding these cases is as follows:

## a) CASE TTF-30, fishing trip terminated in December 2011

## Information presented at the 30<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group

In April and May 2012, letters were sent to both national authorities involved, the vessel's flag State and the port State where the relevant catches were unloaded, indicating that the TTFs received differed in that one included non-dolphin safe fish and the other did not. During the meeting, Venezuela identified itself as the flag State, and indicated that it had received the original TTF and sent it to the Secretariat; there were no discrepancies with the document completed by the observer. The discrepancy was with the copy obtained by the national authority of the Party where the first partial unloading took place, and Venezuela therefore had no elements to continue an investigation because the guidelines for managing TTFs had been complied with in its territory.

The national authority of the Party where the catch was initially unloaded has not answered formally, but in late March 2013, it indicated unofficially that an investigation has started (Document TT-32-04). At the time this report was posted (9 July 2017), the Secretariat had not received any further information.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Dolphin-safe tuna is recorded on the TTF-A, and non dolphin-safe tuna on the TTF-B

# b) CASES TTF-31a, fishing trip terminated in July 2011; and TTF-31b, fishing trip terminated in November 2011

#### Information presented at the 31st meeting of the Working Group

As in the previous case, the vessels are Venezuelan flagged. Trip TTF-31a unloaded completely in Costa Rica, while TTF-31b landed only part of the catch only part of the catch in Costa Rica and the rest in Venezuela. In July 2012, a letter was sent to both national authorities involved, indicating that the TTFs received differed because one included non-dolphin safe fish and the other did not.

In late 2013, the national authority of Costa Rica indicated to the Secretariat unofficially that an investigation had started. At the time of publication of this document (9 July 2018), the Secretariat has not received any further information.

The national authority of Venezuela also indicated informally that the records it sent to the Secretariat did not differ from the information recorded by the observer, and therefore an investigation was not required.

In none of these 3 cases was a dolphin-safe certificate issued of which the Secretariat has a copy. These cases were included in Documents TT-32-04, TT-33-04, TT-34-04, TT-35-04, TT-36-05, TT-37-04, TT-38-04, TT-39-04 and TT-40-04, and at the time of publication of this document, the Secretariat has not received any further information from the national authority of Costa Rica which sent the presumably altered copy.

During the 40<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Working Group, the Costa Rican national authority stated that the corresponding investigations had been carried out, but due to institutional and staff changes, it had become impossible to locate and have access to the corresponding documents; therefore, they requested that these cases be concluded. The Chair of the meeting suggested to the national authority that it officially communicate to the Secretariat its request for closure and the reasons for declaring the cases as concluded. As of the date of publication of this report (9 July 2018), the Secretariat has not received such a request.

#### c) CASE TTF-33, no documentation of catch sharing

# Information presented at the 37<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Permanent Working Group on Tuna Tracking and at the 59<sup>th</sup> meeting of the International Review Panel.

Two vessels of different flags, Panama and Ecuador, both with an observer aboard, shared the catch from a set, but this was not documented in either observer's records or on a TTF. The event was recorded in the logbooks of both vessels. In June 2016, the Secretariat informed the national authorities of both vessels, and the observers were questioned by staff of their respective programs. One observer said that a vessel officer asked him not to document the event to avoid problems with the owner of the vessel, but that there was no intimidation or attempted bribe, while the other observer denied that the event occurred.

In February 2017, the Secretariat received a response from one the Ecuadorian national authority informing that this case was still under investigation. No response has been received from the second vessel's national authority. Both observers have been suspended while the investigation by the competent authorities is pending, and both TTFs were declared invalid.

#### 5. TABLES AND FIGURES

**TABLE 1**. Original TTFs received by the Secretariat, in accordance with paragraph 3.6 of the System for Tracking and Verifying Tuna, by national authority:

	<b>Trips</b> <sup>2</sup>				% of originals received, reported by meeting					
National authority		Trips	TTFs received	TT-41 Aug 2017	TT-40 Oct 2017	TT-39 Jul 2017	TT-38 Oct 2016			
Colombia	COL	29	27	93	100	96	100			
Costa Rica	CRI	12	12	100	60	67	100			
Ecuador	ECU	389	367	94	96	98	91			
El Salvador	SLV	11	8	73	100	89	100			

European Union	EUR	2			2	100	100
Guatemala	GTM	8	7	88	50	87	86
Mexico	MEX	139	139	100	100	87	100
Nicaragua	NIC	0	-	-	100	-	-
Panama	PAN	0	-	-	100	-	-
Peru	PER	43	26	60	88	86	91
United States	USA	11	10	91	75	88	100
Venezuela	VEN	0	-	-	-	-	67
Total		644	598	93	96	94	94

<sup>2</sup> Trips that ended from 1 September 2017 through 31 May 2018.

		Originals received from competent national authority in previous years (%)									
National authority		2017	2016	2015	2014	2013	2012	2011	2010	2009	2008
Bolivia	BOL	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Colombia	COL	36 (100)	35 (95)	44 (92)	40 (100)	45 (96)	43 (100)	54 (100)	44 (100)	46 (90)	59 (87)
Costa Rica	CRI	16 (94)	16 (89)	12 (86)	20 (95)	16 (94)	18 (95)	18 (100)	7 (41)	2 (17)	20 (87)
Ecuador	ECU	550 (99)	463 (99)	474 (97)	420 (99)	409 (99)	385 (99)	360 (99)	307 (100)	352 (100)	399 (100)
El Salvador	SLV	21 (88)	22 (100)	13 (100)	19 (90)	21 (91)	24 (92)	28 (97)	16 (70)	35 (92)	37 (97)
European Union	EUR	1 (25)	1 (100)	5 (63)	9 (64)	5 (71)	17 (100)	5 (50)	3 (60)	4 (100)	5 (100)
Guatemala	GTM	6 (50)	19 (95)	15 (100)	17 (100)	18 (95)	16 (94)	14 (100)	25 (100)	16 (94)	7 (70)
Mexico	MEX	218 (100)	238 (100)	227 (100)	188 (100)	187 (100)	207 (99)	205 (100)	180 (100)	189 (100)	192 (97)
Nicaragua	NIC	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1 (50)	0 (0)
Panama	PAN	-	-	-	1 (50)	-	-	1 (100)	2 (100)	3 (75)	3 (100)
Peru	PER	37 (88)	40 (87)	12 (48)	12 (100)	10 (100)	2 (100)	9 (90)	9 (82)	4 (67)	0 (0)
United States	USA	9 (69)	27 (100)	9 (90)	1 (100)	-	2 (100)	3 (100)	-	2 (100)	1 (100)
Venezuela	VEN	-	2 (29)	7 (100)	6 (100)	11 (92)	20 (100)	28 (82)	31 (100)	35 (92)	21 (62)
Total		896 (97)	863 (98)	818 (96)	733 (98)	722 (98)	734 (99)	725 (98)	624 (97)	689 (96)	744 (95)

**TABLE 2**. Number of original TTFs received by the Secretariat since 2008, and the percentage (in parenthesis) of the total that it represents, by year in which the trip began.



**FIGURE 1**. Comparison of the estimated weights recorded by observers on the TTF-A and the scale weight recorded for each TTF included in the dolphin-safe certificates received. Updated to 6 July 2018.