

**INTERNATIONAL DOLPHIN CONSERVATION PROGRAM
INTERNATIONAL REVIEW PANEL**

PERMANENT WORKING GROUP ON TUNA TRACKING

MINUTES OF THE 15TH MEETING

**La Jolla, California (USA)
19 February 2004
0900-1200**

Chair: Ms. Pat Donley (United States)

AGENDA

1. Opening of the meeting
2. Adoption of the agenda
3. National Tuna Tracking Plans:
 - a) status of national plans
 - b) presentation by Colombia
4. Review of the implementation of the [dolphin safe certification system](#)
5. System for follow-up of invalid certificates
6. Recommendations for the IRP
7. Other business
8. Place and date of next meeting
9. Adjournment

APPENDICES

1. List of attendees

DOCUMENTS

- [TT-15-03](#) Review of national tuna tracking and verification plans
[TT-15-04a](#) Summary of dolphin-safe certification program
[TT-15-04b](#) Original TTFs received by the Secretariat

The 15th Meeting of the Permanent Working Group on Tuna Tracking was held in La Jolla, California (USA), on 19 October 2004. The attendees are listed in Appendix 1.

1. Opening of the meeting

The meeting was opened by Ms. Pat Donley, of the United States, the Chair of the Working Group.

2. Adoption of the agenda

The United States asked that Item 5 of the agenda, *System for follow-up of invalid certificates*, be postponed until the next meeting of the Working Group, at which time it would have a proposal on this issue.

Mexico requested that the United States explain briefly the situation regarding the case filed in the court in San Francisco, California, against the AIDCP dolphin safe label. It was agreed that this would be handled under item 7, *Other Business*.

The provisional agenda was adopted as presented. The Working Group also approved the minutes of its 14th meeting, previously circulated by the Secretariat.

3. National Tuna Tracking Plans

a. Status of national plans

The Secretariat presented its updated review of national tuna tracking and verification plans ([Document TT-15-03](#)). Dr. Robin Allen, Director of the IATTC, explained the results of the reviews carried out since the previous meeting of the Working Group.

The Secretariat reported that the Venezuelan plan had been found to be consistent with the [Tuna Tracking and Verification System](#), and that Bolivia, Honduras, and Nicaragua were now the only Parties without tuna tracking plans.

b. Presentation by Colombia

Colombia made a presentation about its national tuna tracking plan, and answered the questions asked by various members.

4. Review of the implementation of the [dolphin safe certification system](#)

Dr. Allen presented [Document TT-15-04a](#), which updates the information presented during the last meeting of the Working Group and presents information on the comparisons of dolphin safe certificates and their corresponding Tuna Tracking Forms (TTFs).

The document presents the criteria to be followed for issuing AIDCP dolphin safe certificates and the guidelines followed by the Secretariat in case of an inquiry regarding the authenticity of dolphin safe certificates. There have been no enquiries concerning dolphin safe certificates to date.

The document indicates that, as of 28 January 2004, the Secretariat had received 196 *AIDCP dolphin safe* certificates, 11 of which were considered invalid for various reasons.

El Salvador reported that it had experienced problems in controlling the security of TTFs, as well as problems with market acceptance in the face of public criticism of its program by an environmental organization. Several other countries reported similar problems. It was agreed that the confidentiality of TTFs needs to be preserved, and that any breakdowns in the system affecting confidentiality should be identified and corrected. Several delegations commented that the problem of market acceptance mentioned by El Salvador could be helped by promotion of the certification system. Some delegations opined that the list of vessels with DMLs should be made public, but others had reservations, and this was not agreed by the meeting. Dr. Allen made the point that it was the dolphin safe certificates, not the TTFs, which should be used by buyers to document that the tuna in question was dolphin safe.

El Salvador also made the point that there was a need for a more refined tracking and certification system to ensure that canned tuna, as well as loins, whole fish, and all fish in containers being transshipped, can be easily tracked. El Salvador indicated that it would prepare a proposal on this matter for the next meeting.

The Ocean Conservancy asked Dr. Allen if Bolivia has issued any dolphin safe certificates or reported who is the tuna tracking contact in that country. Dr. Allen answered that Bolivia has not issued any certificates or reported its tracking contact.

[Document TT-15-04b](#) presents the total number of original TTFs, by country, received by the Secretariat as of 2 February 2004. Several delegations indicated that they brought TTFs with them or had mailed them to the Secretariat too late to be included in the report. Dr. Allen was asked to update the report and issue the update with the minutes of this meeting.

The United States raised the issue of a Bolivian vessel identified as fishing in the closed area of the EPO in December 2003, and asked if any action has been taken to insure that fish from this trip will not be certificated as dolphin safe. Dr. Allen replied that procedures need to be developed regarding the certification of tuna caught in contravention of IATTC rules. In the meantime, he will write a letter to the nation where the fish was thought to have been unloaded to inform them of the circumstances.

5. System for follow-up of invalid certificates

As previously noted, the Working Group agreed to postpone the discussion of this matter until its next meeting.

6. Recommendations for the IRP

The Working Group had no recommendations for the IRP.

7. Other business

The United States reported on the current status of the litigation in progress on the issue of the U.S. final finding and definition of what constitutes dolphin-safe tuna. Both parties, Earth Island Institute and the U.S. government, have filed briefs with the Court asking for a summary judgement. This means that each has asked the judge to find that their position is the correct one without resorting to a trial. In answer to a question, the United States said that it is not really possible at this time to know how much longer it will be before this case is decided. The judge could give a summary judgement to one side or the other, or neither. If a full scale trial ensues, it could be a quite a while.

Mexico asked that the United States conduct meetings with the representatives of concerned governments in Washington, D.C. to keep them advised of the progress of the litigation.

8. Date and place of next meeting

It was agreed that the next meeting of the Working Group would be held immediately prior to the next meeting of the IRP, scheduled to take place in Lima, Peru, in June 2004. The Chair noted that the next meeting will be a busy one, requiring at least one full day.

9. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned on 19 February 2004.

Appendix 1.

**INTERNATIONAL DOLPHIN CONSERVATION PROGRAM
PROGRAMA INTERNACIONAL PARA LA CONSERVACIÓN DE LOS DELFINES**

**PERMANENT WORKING GROUP ON TUNA TRACKING
GRUPO DE TRABAJO PERMANENTE SOBRE EL SEGUIMIENTO DEL ATUN**

15th MEETING - 15^a REUNION

**February 19, 2004 – 19 de febrero de 2004
La Jolla, California, USA**

ASISTENTES - ATTENDEES

COLOMBIA

CARLOS MOSQUERA
Ministerio de Agricultura y Desarrollo Rural

ARMANDO HERNÁNDEZ
Cámara de la Industria Pesquera

COSTA RICA

**ASDRÚBAL VÁSQUEZ
JOSÉ LUIS ARAYA**
INCOPECA

ECUADOR

**BRUNO LEONE
FRANCISCO LEONE**
Cámara de Pesquería

EL SALVADOR

**SONIA SALAVERRÍA
ELSY SORTO**
Ministerio de Agricultura y Ganadería

MANUEL CALVO

EUROPEAN UNION - UNION EUROPEA

**ROBERTO CESARI
ALAN GRAY**
European Commission
IGNACIO ESCOBAR
Secretaría General de Pesca Marítima

JAVIER ARÍZ TELLERÍA
Instituto Español de Oceanografía
AMOR SOLÁ
Embajada de España en Washington

GUATEMALA

FELIX R. PEREZ ZARCO
Ministerio de Agricultura, Ganadería y Alimentación

MEXICO

**RAMÓN CORRAL
MARTÍN BOTELLO
RICARDO BELMONTES
MARIO AGUILAR
ANGEL GÓMEZ**
CONAPESCA
**PEDRO ULLOA
HUMBERTO ROBLES**
Instituto Nacional de la Pesca

LUIS FUEYO
SEMARNAT/PROFEPA
JOSÉ RODRÍGUEZ CRUZ
ANTONIO SUÁREZ
ALFONSO ROSIÑOL

PANAMA

**ARNULFO FRANCO
MA. PATRICIA DÍAZ**
Autoridad Marítima

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA - ESTADOS UNIDOS DE AMERICA

DAVID HOGAN
JAMES STORY
Department of State
PAT DONLEY
BRETT SCHNEIDER
CHRISTOPHER FANNING
BILL JACOBSON
JEREMY RUSIN

JESSICA KONDEL
MICHELLE ZETWO
National Marine Fisheries Service
SUSAN JACKSON
MARCELA CAMPA
CARY GANN

VANUATU

DAVID JOHNSON
HUGO ALSINA
EDWARD WEISSMAN
Office of Deputy Commissioner of Maritime Affairs

VENEZUELA

ALVIN DELGADO
PNOV

ORGANIZACIONES NO GUBERNAMENTALES--NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS

KITTY BLOCK
The Humane Society

NINA YOUNG
The Ocean Conservancy

TUNA INDUSTRY – INDUSTRIA ATUNERA

PAUL KRAMPE
RAMÓN MONTAÑO
JULIO MORÓN

PERSONAL - STAFF

ROBIN ALLEN, Director
ERNESTO ALTAMIRANO
DAVID BRATTEN
ALEJANDRA FERREIRA
MÓNICA GALVÁN

JOSHUE GROSS
MARTÍN HALL
BRIAN HALLMAN
BERTA JUÁREZ
NICHOLAS WEBB